

Training of Supervisors

Annotated Bibliography and Commentary Prepared for The Council of Applied Master's Programs in Psychology

Joan D. Duer

April 2003

[]'s indicate thoughts, opinions, comments of Duer

Alonso, A. (1985). *The quiet profession: Supervisors of psychotherapy*. New York: Macmillan.

Chapter 9 – A Model Program for Psychotherapy Supervisors

Organizational plan for administration of supervision services which includes Chief of Service or Director, Training Director, Supervisors, Supervisors-in-training, supervisees

Director of training – responsible for the training and maintenance of supervisors; junior members learn in biweekly seminar where new supervisor presents the supervision hour for the group's advice and counsel; more experienced supervisors mentor new supervisors

American Association for Marriage and Family Therapy. (2002). *Approved supervision designation standards and responsibilities handbook*. Alexandria, VA: Author.

Prospective supervisor selects approved supervisor for supervision mentoring (has at least 300 hrs supervision experience)

Has master's in MFT or closely related field, or completed 2 yrs MFT doctoral program

9 learning objectives, must be incorporated into coherent theory and practice of MFT supervision must be in training 2 yrs

must complete a 30 contact hour course in supervision fundamentals

must provide 180 hrs of clinical supervision (2 supervisees for at least 9 months each)

at least 36 hrs supervision mentoring

be eligible for AAMFT Clinical Membership

must have had at least 2 yrs clinical experience post licensure or clinical membership

good for 5 yrs

guidelines for the content of supervision, should be clinical not administrative, on development of supervisor

also guidelines on supervision of people seeking AAMFT clinical membership

[maybe go back for more details later]

Bernard, J. M. (1992). Training master's level counseling students in the fundamentals of clinical supervision. *The Clinical Supervisor, 10*, 133-143.

Survey of 57 CACREP accredited programs, asked credentials of site supervisors for practicum & internship

32 (56%) returned – mean 70% of site supervisors from practicum and 72% for internship held either master's degree or 6th yr degree (C.A.S. or Ed.S.)

only 7% 6th yr, so **over 70% have master's as highest degree**

“seem to confront the assumption in counseling and psychology that supervision is a doctoral level activity”

counselor training programs divided into those with training clinics often under tutelage of doctoral students and those that rely on uneven world of off-campus placements

almost universal lack of formal training in supervision among site supervisors

many programs prefer to use own graduates as site supervisors

including supervision training within master's program would help prepare future site supervisors for program

describes training and use of "Peer Supervisors" in master's program in community or school counseling;

select ready interns and pair with one practicum student, meet weekly with peer and are supervised by faculty

at beginning of semester, weekend workshop on supervision

workshops open to site supervisors

workshop consists of:

1. analysis of baseline focus and role behavior
2. presentation of major categories for conceptualization of supervision
3. practice using the Discrimination Model (Bernard, 79)
4. presentation & practice using Interpersonal Process Recall (Kagan, 75)
5. presentation & practice of process of evaluation
6. consideration of ethical & legal issues

have conducted 5 cycles of training interns and of using interns as peer supervisors

worked well, with some pitfalls, less stressful supervision for trainee, but recommend not involving peer supervisor in evaluative component

seems feasible and appropriate to introduce fundamental of supervision at the culmination of master's training

Bernard, J. M., & Goodyear, R. K. (1998). *Fundamentals of clinical supervision* (2nd ed., pp.224-243). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon.

Chapter 11 – Supervisor Development and Training

Quotes Hoffman (94) that the traditional lack of formal training for supervisors and the mental health professions' "dirty little secret"

Supervisor development models: (Table 11.1 pp. 226 compares models)

1. Alonso's model
 - Influenced by psychodynamic and life-span development, encompasses entire professional life as a supervisor
 - Novice stage – nurturing dream about what they might become, must develop sense of self-as-supervisor, anxiety about having to defend new skills after having achieved status as a therapist
 - Midcareer stage – moving from focus on self to more of a focus on others
 - Late career – need to maintain self-esteem in the face of tendency to devalue older people, could have role of "village elder"
2. Hess's model
 - Beginning stage – changes role from trainee to supervisor and reference group from novice to more experienced clinician – creates ambiguity and roles and technique, vulnerable to self-consciousness and sensitivity to peer and trainee criticism, employ concrete structure and focus on client
 - Exploration stage – internalized belief in the value of supervision
 - Might be too restrictive in supervisory roles, may become too intrusive with trainee
 - Confirmation of supervisor identity stage – gratitude and pride in trainees' successes, less dependent on validation from others
 - Able to be in the relationship with trainee
3. Rodenhauser's model
 - Emulation stage – newest supervisors emulate their previous role models
 - Conceptualization stage – search for own methods and guidelines through interacting with peers

Incorporation stage – increasing awareness of the importance of the supervisory relationship, awareness of individual differences that affect supervisory triad

Consolidation stage – increasing ability to use supervisee’s countertransference reactions in supervision

4. Stoltenber and Delworth’s model
 - Series of stages analogous to those in their counselor development model
 - Level I – feel anxious about doing the right thing, mechanistic and structured, assume “expert” stance, often effective supervising Level I Trainees, who want structure and expertness
 - Level II – confusion and conflict, realize harder than thought, might blame trainees for own problems, need their own supervisors to be expert and consistent with them
 - Level III – consistent motivation toward the supervisor role, function with relative autonomy
 - Level III integrated – master supervisors, can work well with trainees at any level

5. Watkins’s model
 - Supervision complexity model (SCM)
 - Principle developmental issues:
 - Competency versus incompetency
 - Autonomy versus dependency
 - Identity versus identity diffusion
 - Self-awareness versus unawareness
 - Stage 1 – role shock, “the imposter phenomenon”
 - Stage 2 – role recovery and transition
 - Stage 3 – role consolidation
 - Stage 4 – role mastery

Research examining supervisor developmental models has been virtually nonexistent

Table 11.4 pp. 237-238, lists books on supervision published 1972-1998

Description of Bernard’s Structured Workshop in Clinical Supervision

Discusses supe-of-supe (supervision of supervision)

Borders, L. D., Bernard, J. M., Dye, H. A., Fong, M. L., Henderson, P., & Nance, D. W. (1991). Curriculum guide for training counseling supervisors: Rationale, development, and implementation. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 31*, 58-80.

Instruction in supervision is required for doctoral students in CACREP accredited programs, and has been recommended for counseling psych programs

Developed by subcommittee of ACES – formed June 1989, tasked to design a curriculum guide that would meet “standards for Counseling Supervisors” (Dye & Borders, 90)

3 curriculum threads emphasized in each of the standards:

- a. self-awareness
- b. theoretical and conceptual knowledge
- c. skills and techniques

7 core curriculum areas:

- a. models of supervision
- b. counselor development
- c. supervision methods and techniques
- d. supervisory relationship
- e. ethical, legal, and professional regulatory issues
- f. evaluation
- g. executive (administrative) skills

for each core area, specific learning objectives in each of the curriculum threads were written assumed that supervisors-in-training would be trained counselors with extensive experience; assumed there would be a sequence of didactic and experiential instruction can be used in academic programs or modified for continuing education

Borders, L. D., & Leddick, G. R. (1988). A nationwide survey of supervision training. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 27, 271-283.

Survey to 450 counselor education or psychology programs in 83-85 Hollis & Wantz [20 yrs old] Did they have a course in supervision? If so, please send syllabus
47 programs that responded said offered supervision courses (38 awarded doctoral degree) – 3 gave master’s degrees, but 2 of these courses “on the books”
most courses included both didactic and experiential components and were open to at least advanced graduate students
students in supervision courses typically received group supervision (some individual and some both)

Bradley, L. J., & Whiting, P. P. (2001). Supervision training: A model. In L. J. Bradley & N. Ladany (Eds.). *Counselor supervision: Principles, process, and practice* (3rd ed. pp. 361-387). Philadelphia: Brunner-Routledge.

Model from training supervisors presented

Three components – conceptual, experiential, integrative, separates process into stage components
Borders & Leddick (88) reported only 1/3 counselor prep programs provided training in supervision
Supervisory training needed, experience alone can’t quality one

Borders et al. (91) described supervisory training as development of curriculum that uses 3 emphases of current professional standards; self-awareness, theoretical and conceptual knowledge, and skills and techniques; also 7 core curriculum areas: models of supervision, counselor development, methods and techniques, the supervisory relationship, ethical, legal, and professional regulatory issues; evaluation; and executive & administrative skills

Study on supervision training (Borders & Leddick, 88) surveyed 450 counseling programs – 60 responded; 47 reported offered supervision course; authors concluded supervision models were taught more frequently than supervision techniques; top 6 models presented: instructional or behavioral, developmental, client-centered or personal growth, psychoanalytic, skill training and development

Table 15.3 presents a model of supervision training (pg. 368); in depth description of issues to be addressed and evaluation of supervisor in training

[good source]

Center for Credentialing & Education, Inc. (n.d.). *Approved Clinical Supervisor: Certification requirements*. Retrieved April 14, 2003, from <http://www.cce-global.org>

Credential recognized by National Board for Certified Counselors, Inc.
Joint effort with Association for Counselors Education and Supervision
Specialized Training (must have either A or B):

- A. 2 sh course in clinical supervision
- B. 30 contact hours of workshop training in clinical supervision

either A or B must include at least:

- 1. roles and functions of clinical supervisors
- 2. models of clinical supervision
- 3. mental health-related professional development

4. methods and techniques in clinical supervision
5. supervisory relationship issues
6. cultural issues in clinical supervision
7. group supervision
8. legal and ethical issues in clinical supervision
9. evaluation of supervisee competence and the supervision process

mental health-related experience:

min 5 yrs post-master's experience which includes 1,500 hrs direct service

supervision experience/endorsement:

min 100 hrs clinical supervision of mental health services with supervisees

min 20 hrs of supervision-of-supervision

Certification for experienced supervisors (alternative entry)

Meet one of:

- A. mental health professionals with 5 yrs as clinical supervisor and at least 500 hrs providing clinical supervision
- B. mental health-related educators with 5 yrs full-time employment teaching in an education program at regionally-accredited institution; teaching assignments must have included 10 courses of practicum or internship supervision or 10 related courses that primarily required educator to perform role of clinical supervisor
- C. those who possess a recognized clinical supervision credential:
 - AAMFT: Approved Supervisor Designation
 - American Association of Pastoral Counselors: Certified Supervisors
 - British Association for Counselling: Counselling Supervisor Accreditation
 - NCC's who formerly held designation of Clinical Supervisor through the Academy of Mental Health Counselors
 - Licensed or certified as a clinical supervisor by a state counselor credentialing board

Duer, J. D. (2002). Supervision in the training of applied master's psychologists. In D. C. Solly & R. Hays-Thomas (Eds.). *Mastering the future: Proceedings of the Third National Conference on Master's Psychology* (pp. 77-78). Richmond, KY: Council of Applied Master's in Psychology Programs.

Weaknesses of lack of specific training in supervision: only as good as your best supervisor, significant time lapse, only self as model of supervisee, model of supervision may be inappropriate
Cites ethics codes of Association for Counseling Education and Supervision – supervisors should have training in supervision

CACREP required faculty who supervise to have relevant training and supervision experience

Need for continuing education experiences for master's level psychologists who wish to supervise

Any information on IO Psych supervision?

Dye, H. A., & Borders, L. D. (1990). Counseling supervisors: Standards for preparation and practice. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 69, 27-32.*

Instruction in supervision required in CACREP doctoral programs; separate credential proposed (AAMFT & NACCMHC have "approved supervisors") [now in place]

Supervision Interest Network of ACES began identifying core competencies of supervisors in 80's

Determined important: conceptual knowledge of supervision process and direct intervention skills, facilitative skills and personal traits

Relationship factors are as significant as technical skills in supervisory effectiveness

Standards endorsed by ACES Executive Council October 88, AACD Governing Council July 89, AACSB, Feb 90

Standards – 11 core areas of knowledge, competencies, personal traits relating to:

1. effective counselors
2. personal traits & characteristics
3. ethical, legal, & regulatory aspects
4. personal & professional nature of the supervisory relationship
5. supervision methods & techniques
6. counselor developmental process
7. case conceptualization & management
8. assessment & evaluation
9. oral & written reporting & recording
10. evaluation of counseling performance
11. research in counseling & counseling supervision

(subpoints under each)

supervision distinct field of preparation & practice

sequence of training ordinarily: grad training in counseling supervision including didactic courses, seminars, laboratory courses, & supervision practica; continuing ed experiences

training generally occurs during advanced graduate studies or continuing professional development

not to say supervisor training in the pre-service stage without merit

Hoffman, L. W. (1994). The training of psychotherapy supervisors: A barren scape. *Psychotherapy in Private Practice*, 13, 23-42.

Argues for the recognition of formal training as a qualification for psychotherapy supervisors & describes a proposed training program

Training gap has important consequences in that promising supervisors with little or no training flee the role, also modeling of bad supervision is passed on to new generations of practitioners

A workshop participant referred to lack of training in supervision as our profession's "dirty little secret"

This article summarizes author's full-length book (Hoffman, 90) [Hoffman, L.W. (1990). *Old scapes, new maps: A training program for psychotherapy supervisors*. Cambridge, MA: Milusik Press.]

Training program for psychotherapy supervisors:

2 semester seminar for third-year graduate students enrolled in school of prof psych

3 stages: preparatory, transition, practice

Preparatory stage:

Complete Supervision Life Line, differentiation and definition, simulation of supervision, organizing principles (parallel process, Gestalt cycle of experience and Gestalt interactive cycle, bipersonal field)

Transition stage:

Variables in matching supervisor and supervisee, supervisory contract, assessment of supervisee

Practice stage:

Beginning phase, middle phase, end phase

No empirical evaluation of training program, but anecdotal support

Knapp, S., & Vandecreek, L. (1997). Ethical and legal aspects of clinical supervision. In C. E. Watkins (Ed.). *Handbook of psychotherapy supervision* (pp. 589-599). New York: Wiley.

64% of licensed psychologists reported spending part of their time in teaching, including supervision of students and interns (Rosenfeld, Shimberg, & Thornton, 83)

licensing boards generally require greater degree of control and more intensive supervision to psychologists-in-training (seeking licensure) than to employees

licensing laws frequently adopt the supervisory guidelines recommended by the ASPPB

APA ethics: “psychologists provide services, teach, and conduct research only within the boundaries of their competence, based on their education, training, supervised experience, or appropriate professional experience (Principle 1.04)

ASPPB: “Supervising psychologists shall be licensed or certified for the practice of psychology and have adequate training, knowledge, and skill to render competently any psychological service which their supervisee undertakes. They shall not supervise or permit their supervisee to engage in any psychological practice which they cannot perform competently themselves. (Guideline A. Qualifications)”

Guidelines imply psychologists/supervisors should have specific knowledge and skills as supervisors – yet acquiring these skills currently a haphazard endeavor

ASPPB guidelines – “no more than three full-time persons may be registered for any one supervisor”

Lack of timely feedback is root of many ethical complaints brought against supervisors (Keith-Spiegel & Koocher, 85)

Written records of supervision should be kept

Neufeldt, S. A. (1994). Use of a manual to train supervisors. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 33, 327-336.

Manual created to use in training supervisors for beginning practicum students – specific supervision strategies in behavioral terms and examples, intended as supplement to more general textbooks

Teaching beginning supervisors to train counselors in use of discrete skills in 1st yr of training & assist development into reflective practitioners

Manual 2 sections: corresponding 2 terms of beginning practicum course, 17 basic supervision strategies for 1st term, 9 advanced strategies 2nd term (strategies listed in Table 1)

Supervision strategy described, and tells when & why should be used

Designed to meet beginning students’ needs as described in lit

Generally positive feedback from trainees and practicum students

[references for training manuals published subsequently:

Neufeldt, S. A., Iverson, J. N., & Juntunen, C. L. (1995). *Supervision strategies for the first practicum*. Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.

Neufeldt, S. A. (1999). *Supervision strategies for the first practicum, (2nd ed.)*. Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.]

Neufeldt, S. A. (2001). Educating supervisors: A constructivist approach to the teaching of supervision. In K Eriksen & G. McAuliffe (Eds.), *Teaching counselors and therapists: Constructivist and developmental course design* (pp. 169-184). Westport, CT: Bergin & Garvey.

Advocates yearlong course in supervision theory and practice from constructivist perspective – importance of sense of equality among learners and teachers

Primary goal to teach reflectivity – ability to look at one’s work with clients, evaluate it, place it in context, and change one’s approach when suitable

Those who educate supervisors must teach not only skill of reflectivity but means for teaching it to their supervisees

Cites Dawes (94) that much contemporary supervision practice based on principles that have little or no empirical support

Training sequence – first supervision theory course to advanced graduate students covers 1st third of year, covers theory and available knowledge base about supervision

Then they engage in supervision of students enrolled in their first counseling practicum

In seminar have students respond in writing to questions that tie what have read to professional and personal experiences with learning

Differs from traditional supervisor training in infusion of constructivist principles into every assignment

Supervision theory course:

Creation of a collegial environment: instruction and self-disclosure – instructor participates first
 Assigns Freire and Schon on political hierarchy in academic life – to make power issues explicit
 Also uses text such as Bernard and Goodyear, Watkins, or Skovholt and Ronnestad

Supervision practicum:

Uses inquiry about reasoning behind decisions, even “wrong interventions”

Use of reflective journals

Potential problems – more work for university supervisor, might have to intervene to ensure client welfare and supervisor development

Peake, T. H., Nussbaum, B. D., & Tindell, S. D. (2002). Clinical and counseling supervision references: Trends and needs. *Psychotherapy: Theory/Research/Practice/Training*, 39, 114-125.

Supervision now part of APA accreditation guidelines – one of the central domains of training

As clinical psych’s begin shifting to managerial positions in managed care, their role as supervisors has increased and is adapted to brief therapy model

Lists supervision and training references from 1990 to 2000 (representative, not exhaustive according to authors)

Robiner, W., N., & Schofield, W. (1990). References on supervision in clinical and counseling psychology. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 21, 297-312.

No solid theoretical base, standard literature, or syllabus for supervision

Brief introductory comments

29 refs listed

Rodenhauser, P. (1997). Psychotherapy supervision: Prerequisites and problems in the process. In C. E. Watkins (Ed.). *Handbook of psychotherapy supervision* (pp. 527-548). New York: Wiley.

From Psychiatry, last set of standards for supervisors published in 57

Directors of residency education in psychiatry have identified psychotherapy as one of the most difficult skills to teach (Rodenhauser, 92) & that for many trainees, psychotherapy skills don’t change over time (Buckley et al., 82)

In psychiatry, basic qualification for serving as psychotherapy supervisor continues to be one’s own experience as a psychotherapy supervisee

Clinical knowledge and expertise, a consolidated professional identity, and enthusiasm for teaching are prereqs for effective psychotherapy supervision

Trouble spots in psychotherapy supervision:

- a. uniform standards for training in psychotherapy have not been established
- b. social, political, and economic pressures are rapidly changing the configuration and accessibility of psychotherapy-particularly the availability of long-term psychotherapy
- c. standards for competency to provide psychodynamic psychotherapy supervision have not been developed
- d. there is no generally accepted theoretical model of supervision
- e. many supervisors lack skill diversity and flexibility with a variety of theories and practices of psychotherapy (availability of suitable supervisors problem in psychiatry)
- f. supervision of psychotherapy supervisors is uncommon
- g. personal and professional boundaries are often violated in the process of psychotherapy supervision
- h. courses and seminars for psychotherapy supervisors are at a premium

Russell, R. K., & Petrie, T. (1994). Issues in training effective supervisors. *Applied & Preventive Psychology, 3, 27-42.*

[most of article really about supervision in general, but one section gives recommendations for supervisor training]

supervisor development – discusses early models of Alonso and Hess
more on Stoltenberg and Delworth model and Hess's Supervisor Complexity model
[covered elsewhere in this bibliography]

all models in formative stages and lack supporting empirical data

specific recommendations for supervisor training have been suggested by:

Loganbill & Hardy (83) – coursework in supervision include theoretical content component, with simulated experiences and in vivo practice in supervision

Drapela (85) – teaching consultation and supervision skills using three-dimensional intervention model

Taub, Porter, & Frisch (88) – doctoral-level supervision traineeship program almost entirely experiential

Borders et al. (91) – subcommittee of ACES [covered earlier in this bibliography], but these authors note that it “unfortunately falls victim to its own complexity”, “overwhelming to consider attempting to incorporate the 200-plus specific learning objectives included in the complete guide.”

Training demands adequate time – at least over a one-semester or two-quarter time period

Limited to advanced graduate students who have completed at least 1 yr of practicum training – functioning minimally at mid-to advanced Level 2 in Stoltenberg's counselor complexity model

Should include didactic and experiential components

Didactic: theoretical models of supervision, supervision research, ethical and professional issues

Good use of “Goodyear Tapes” on supervision styles of famous therapists

Supervision seminars – therapy session occurred and 1 hr supervision session followed, supervision session videotaped and presented in 2hr weekly supervision-of-supervision class meeting

Scott, K. J., Ingram, K. M., Vitanza, S. A., & Smith, N. G. (2000). Training in supervision: A survey of current practices. *The Counseling Psychologist, 28, 403-422.*

Addressed supervision in APA accredited doctoral programs and predoctoral internships

Supervision has been identified as core experience defining specialty of counseling psychology (Davis et al, 92: Meara et al, 88)

No studies currently exist that examine who is doing supervision training or that assess the extent, type or effectiveness of training in supervision

123 surveys returned by directors of APA programs:

importance of training in supervision rated 4.21 (on 6 pt scale)

half of programs either required (30%) or offered (20%) a didactic course in supervision

practicum in supervision required (23%) or offered (31%)

reasons for not offering supervision courses: budget constraints (35%) and perception that time for learning to supervise better left for internship or job (35%)

counseling programs reported supervision training as more important than clinical programs

didactic course requirement or elective in 85% counseling programs, 34% clinical programs

79% of counseling programs required or offered practicum, 43% of clinical programs

those in clinical programs tended to supervise for more months during year than counseling programs

agree supervision training should occur before on the job (95% counseling and 91% clinical)

training should begin prior to internship (95% counseling, 65% clinical)

interestingly more programs thought training should begin before on job than during internships

counseling psych programs providing more training of supervisors

disagreement as to when training should begin

but questionnaire responses only reflect views of the one person who completed the survey

Vasquez, M. J. T. (1992). Psychologist as clinical supervisor: Promoting ethical practice. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 23, 196-202.

Promotion of ethics in education and training in structured settings, e.g. supervision of predoctoral students in organized internship, but could apply to other settings as well

Promoting a care perspective in supervision – reminding supervisees of importance of maintaining empathy for those hurting and in need

Stress and anxiety to appear competent may lead to making clients less real

Responsibility of supervisor – assess skills to ensure competence through audio-and videotapes, notes, discussion, cotherapy, and observations

Assess supervisee's limitation, blind spots, and impairments to protect clients

Psychologists who supervise must be well trained, knowledgeable, and skilled in practice of clinical supervision

64% of licensed counseling psychologists spent part of time in supervisory activities, less clear what percentage adequately prepared

competence and expertise may be acquired and maintained through formal education, training, supervised experience, and readings of ongoing research and theory

Commentary

For this section I reviewed research on the training of supervisors but did not include books that have been written to serve primarily as textbooks in supervision courses.

Most of these sources advocate that training in supervision is necessary, but differ as to when such training should occur (pre vs. post degree) and at what level training is appropriate (master's vs. doctoral).

Some differences exist based on type of doctoral program with counseling psych programs more likely to provide formal supervision training (Scott et al., 2000).

None empirically evaluate outcome of training – are trained supervisors indeed more effective?

I wonder if the data from Bernard (92) still hold – that 70% of supervisors of master's students had a master's degree as their highest degree. If so, this certainly flies in the face of the belief that supervision is only a doctoral level activity. If so, it emphasizes the problems of lack of supervisor training, especially in master's programs, given few doctoral supervisors have had formal training, much less master's supervisors.

Duer, J.D. (2003). *Training in supervision: Annotated bibliography and commentary*. Pensacola, FL: Council of Applied Master's Programs in Psychology.